

**Article title:** Utility of the Right to Health for Addressing Skilled Health Worker Shortages in Low- and Middle-Income Countries

**Journal name:** International Journal of Health Policy and Management (IJHPM)

**Authors' information:** Kenneth Yakubu<sup>1\*</sup>, Seye Abimbola<sup>2</sup>, Andrea Durbach<sup>3</sup>, Christine Balane<sup>4</sup>, David Peiris<sup>1</sup>, Rohina Joshi<sup>5</sup>

<sup>1</sup>The George Institute for Global Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

<sup>2</sup>School of Public Health, University of Sydney, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

<sup>3</sup>Australian Human Rights Institute, Faculty of Law, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

<sup>4</sup>Discipline of Paediatrics, School of Women's and Children's Health, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia.

<sup>5</sup>School of Population Health, Faculty of Medicine, University of New South Wales, Sydney, NSW, Australia

(\*Corresponding author: [kyakubu@georgeinstitute.org.au](mailto:kyakubu@georgeinstitute.org.au))

**Supplementary file 3.** Studies Included in the Review, and Their Corresponding Right to Health Items

#### 4. Main content:

Citation	Study type	Countries involved & income status	Right to Health (RTH) items
Abuagla A., Badr E. (2016) <sup>26</sup>	Mixed methods (key informant interviews + Document Reviews)	Sudan (LMIC) Libya (UMIC) Saudi Arabia (HIC)	RTH 8, 9, 12
Dovlo D. (2003) <sup>27</sup>	Case study	Ethiopia (LICs) Ghana (LMIC) Botswana (UMIC) Cuba (UMIC) Jamaica (UMIC)	RTH 8, 9, 11, 12
Sato C. (2012) <sup>28</sup>	Working Paper Series	South Africa (UMIC) The Caribbean (MICs) Britain (HIC)	RTH 8, 11, 12
Connell J., Stilwell B. (2006) <sup>29</sup>	Book Section		
Edge J.S., Hoffman S.J. (2013) <sup>30</sup>	Survey of key informants	Australia (HIC) Canada (HIC) United Kingdom (HIC) United States of America (HIC)	RTH 12

Plotnikova E.V. (2012) <sup>31</sup>	Qualitative Content Analysis of Policy Documents	LMICs in general Philippines (LMIC) India (LMIC) South Africa (UMIC) United Kingdom (HIC)	RTH 8, 11, 12
Bevan S. (2005) <sup>32</sup>	Report	United Kingdom (HIC) South Africa (LMIC)	RTH 12
Willets A., Martineau T. (2006) <sup>33</sup>	Report	United Kingdom (HIC) Sub-Saharan Africa (LMICs) South Africa (UMIC)	RTH 12
Dauphinee WD. (2005) <sup>34</sup>	Commentary	Canada (HIC) South Africa (UMICs)	RTH 12
Adhikari R., Grigulis A. (2014) <sup>35</sup>	Qualitative study (in-depth interviews)	Malawi (LIC) Nepal (LIC) United Kingdom (HIC)	RTH 12
Blacklock et al (2012) <sup>36</sup>	Time series analysis	India (LMIC) Philippines (LMIC) South Africa (UMIC) United Kingdom (HIC)	RTH 11, 12
Buchan, J. (2002) <sup>37</sup>	Case study	United Kingdom (HIC) South Africa (UMIC) The Caribbean (MICs)	RTH 12
Buchan J. et al (2009) <sup>38</sup>	Case studies	Kenya (LMIC)  LMICs in general South Africa (UMIC) United Kingdom (HIC)  Ghana (LMIC)	RTH 5, 8, 9,12
Squires A. et al (2016) <sup>39</sup>	Random effects panel data analysis	United States (HICs)	RTH 8
Tankwanchi et al (2019) <sup>40</sup>	Secondary analysis of health worker migration trends	Western Countries (HICs)  South Africa (UMIC) Southern Africa countries (LMICs) OECD countries (HICs)  United Kingdom (HIC)	RTH 8, 9,11, 12
Herfs PG. (2014) <sup>41</sup>	Qualitative study (structured questionnaires)	United Kingdom (HIC) Netherlands (HIC) Tanzania (LIC) Kenya (LMIC) Nigeria (LMIC) South Africa (UMIC), Afghanistan (LIC), Iraq (UMIC), Romania (UMIC) and Surinam (UMIC)	RTH 12
Tankwanchi AB. et al (2015) <sup>42</sup>	Uncontrolled Before-and-After study	United States of America (HIC) Sub-Saharan Africa (LMICs)	RTH 8, 12
Peñaloza B. et al (2011) <sup>43</sup>	Systematic review	USA (HIC) LMICs	N/A
Kober K. et al (2004) <sup>44</sup>	Case study	Mozambique (LIC) Malawi (LIC) Cuba (UMIC) South Africa (UMIC) Southern African Development Community (SADC) International NGO (Médecins Sans Frontières)	RTH 8,9, 11,12

Moullan Y. (2009) <sup>46</sup>	Analysis paper	LMICs in general Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) countries. (HICs)	RTH 4, 8, 9, 11
Schulze et al. (2014) <sup>47</sup>	Editorial	Malawi (LIC) Germany (HIC)	RTH 8, 11,12
Ossai EN. et al (2012) <sup>48</sup>	Systematic review	Mali (LIC), Santé Sud (International NGO)	RTH 8, 9
Sherr K. et al (2012) <sup>49</sup>	Observational prospective study	Mozambique (LIC) International NGOs	RTH 5, 8, 11
Barnighausen T. et al (2009) <sup>50</sup>	Cost Benefit Analysis	Sub-Saharan Africa	RTH 8, 9
Cailhol J. et al (2013) <sup>51</sup>	Mixed methods (semi-structured interviews + analysis of secondary data)	Angola (LMIC) Burundi (LIC) Lesotho (LIC) Mozambique (UMIC) South Africa (UMIC) United States (HIC) International NGOs	RTH 5, 8, 9 11
Shaffer FA. et al (2016) <sup>52</sup>	Case study	United States (HICs) Philippines (LMIC) India (LMIC)	RTH 12
Mandeville KL. et al (2015, 2016) <sup>53,54</sup>	Retrospective Cohort Study Discrete Choice Experiment	Malawi (LIC) Britain (HIC) South Africa (UMIC) Germany (HIC)	RTH 6, 8, 9, 11,12
Brush BL. et al (2007) <sup>55</sup>	Analysis paper	Philippines (LMIC) United Kingdom (HIC)	RTH 12
Yan J. et al (2006) <sup>56</sup> Salmon ME. et al (2007) <sup>65</sup>	Conference presentation Contextual Analysis	International NGO Caribbean region (MICs) St Vincent (UMIC) United States of America (HIC) Antigua (HIC) Grenada (UMIC) Jamaica (UMICs) United States (HIC) Canada (HIC)	RTH 8, 11,12
Geber H. (2013) <sup>57</sup>	Program report	South Africa (UMIC) International NGO - CARTA (The Consortium for Advanced Research Training in Africa is a project within the APHRC. The project, funded by Wellcome Trust).	RTH 8, 11
Zijlstra EE. et al (2007) <sup>58</sup>	Analysis paper	Norway, Netherlands, Sweden and the UK (HICs) Malawi (LIC)	RTH 8, 11
Dambisya Y. et al (2007) <sup>59</sup>	Review	Botswana (UMIC) Lesotho (LIC) Mozambique (LIC) Malawi (LIC) Tanzania (LIC) Uganda Zambia (LMIC)	RTH 8, 9, 11,12

		Eswatini (LIC) Mauritius (UMIC) *East and Southern Africa (LMICs) National, Regional and International NGOs (CHAM, Southern Africa Capacity initiative, WHO, UNDP)	
Henderson LN. et al (2008) <sup>60</sup>	Review	Papua New Guinea (LMIC) Vietnam (LMIC) Thailand (UMIC) Cambodia (LMIC) Philippines (LMIC) International NGO (Global fund)	RTH 8, 9,11,12
Kober K., Van Damme W. (2006) <sup>61</sup>	Case study	Eswatini (LIC) International NGOs (WHO, Global Fund)	RTH 8, 9, 11
Tambulasi R.I.C. (2012) <sup>63</sup>	Analysis paper	Malawi (LIC) International NGOs	RTH 8, 9, 11
Reid S.J. (2001) <sup>60</sup>	Mixed methods (Qualitative semi-structured interviews + cross sectional surveys)	South Africa (UMIC)	RTH 5,8,12
Chimbari M. et al (2008) <sup>66</sup>	Cross-sectional survey	Zimbabwe (LMIC)	RTH 8,9,11,12
Mufunda J. et al (2007) <sup>67</sup>	Program evaluation	Zimbabwe (LMIC)	RTH 5, 8, 9
Iiping S. et al (2009) <sup>68</sup>	Case studies	Lesotho (LIC) Malawi (LIC) Tanzania (LIC) Malawi (LIC) Eswatini (LIC) Mozambique (LIC) Zambia (LMIC) Mauritius (UMIC) East and Southern African region (LMICs)	RTH 8, 9, 11,12
Masango S. et al (2008) <sup>69</sup>	Case study	Eswatini (LIC)	RTH 8,9
van Rensburg, H.C.J. (2014) <sup>70</sup>	Analysis paper	South Africa (UMIC)	RTH 1, 5, 8, 11,12
Darko VM. et al (2006) <sup>71</sup>	Prospective study	Ghana (LMIC)	RTH 8, 12
George A. et al (2019) <sup>72</sup>	Cross-sectional survey	South Africa (UMIC)	RTH 1, 5, 8, 12
Paina L. et al (2016) <sup>73</sup>	Analysis paper	Romania (LMIC)	RTH 5,8,9,12
Hammett D. (2014) <sup>74</sup>	Qualitative study (individual interviews)	South Africa (UMIC) Cuba (UMIC)	RTH 5,8,9,11,12
Kanchanachitra C. et al (2011) <sup>75</sup>	Review	Cambodia (LMIC) Laos (LMIC) Myanmar (LMIC) Thailand (UMIC) Indonesia (LMIC) Philippines (LMIC)	RTH 1,5, 8,9,10,12
Walton-Roberts M. et al (2017) <sup>76</sup>	Mixed methods (scoping review, survey and interviews)	India (LMIC)	RTH 12
George G. et al (2012) <sup>77</sup>	Review	South Africa (UMIC)	RTH 8

Chirwa Y. et al (2014) <sup>78</sup>	Review	Zimbabwe (LMIC)	RTH 5, 8, 9, 12
Mullan F. et al (2011) <sup>79</sup>	Cross sectional survey	Mali (LIC) France (HIC) Sub-Saharan Africa (LMICs) Europe (HICs) North America (HIC) Mozambique (LIC) South Africa (UMIC) Ethiopia (LIC) Nigeria (LMIC)	RTH 8,9,11,12
van de Pas R et al (2016) <sup>80</sup>	Case studies.	East Africa (LMICs) Southern Africa (LMICs) Europe (HIC)	RTH 12
Manning C. et al (2007) <sup>81</sup>	Reports	Thailand (UMIC) Indonesia (LMIC) Philippines (LMIC) Cambodia (LMIC)	RTH 8, 12
Efendi F., Chen C. (2014) <sup>82</sup>	Poster presentation	Indonesia (LMIC)	RTH 12
Lassey AT. et al (2013) <sup>83</sup>	Cross-sectional survey	Ghana (LMIC)	RTH 8,9
Wiwanitkit V. (2011) <sup>84</sup>	Policy report	Thailand (UMIC)	RTH 5, 6, 8, 9, 12
Enlinson M., Mazetto D. (2018) <sup>85</sup> Harris M. (2016) <sup>86</sup>	Program evaluation	Brazil (UMIC) Cuba (UMIC)	RTH 1, 5 8,9,11
Bode CO. et al (2013) <sup>87</sup>	Cross-sectional survey	West Africa (LMICs)	RTH 8, 9,11
Derbew M. et al (2016) <sup>88</sup>	Cross sectional survey	Ethiopia (LIC)	RTH 8
Labonte R. et al. (2015) <sup>89</sup>	Mixed methods (scoping review, key informant interviews)	South Africa (UMIC) Cuba (UMIC) United States of America (HIC) Southern Africa Development Community (LMICs)	RTH 5, 8, 9,11,12
Hongoro C., McPake B. (2004) <sup>90</sup>	Report	Philippines (LMIC) Ghana (LMIC) South Africa (UMIC) Thailand (UMIC) Australia (HIC) UK (HIC)	RTH 8, 9,11, 12
Willis-Shattuck M. et al (2008) <sup>92</sup>	Systematic review	Bangladesh (LMIC) Kazakhstan (UMIC) South Africa (UMIC) Cameroon (LMIC) Zimbabwe (LMIC) Uganda (LIC) Mali (LIC)	RTH 8,9
Ndetei DM. et al (2008) <sup>92</sup>	Mixed methods (survey, key informant interviews, analysis of secondary data)	Kenya (LMIC)	RTH 8, 9, 11,12
Oman KM. et al (2009) <sup>93</sup>	Qualitative study (semi-structured interviews)	Fiji (UMIC) Countries in the Pacific Island (LMICs)	RTH 8, 12

**Key:** LIC – low income country, LMIC- low- and middle-income country, and HIC – high income country.